



Journal of Religion & Culture

Turriff, Shaun L.

Review of *Le vert et le bleu: Identité québécoise et identité irlandaise au tournant du xxe siècle*, by Simon Jolivet.

Journal of Religion and Culture, vol. 23 (2012). 73-75p.

The *Journal of Religion and Culture* is a peer-reviewed journal published by the graduate students of the Department of Religion at Concordia University, Montreal, Quebec.

This publication is available online thanks to the support of the Faculty of Arts and Sciences at Concordia University, Montreal, Quebec. Neither Concordia University nor its Faculty of Arts and Sciences is liable for any damages, costs, or losses whatsoever arising in any circumstances from these services.

© 2012 Shaun L. Turriff

In *Le vert et le bleu*, Simon Jolivet examines various aspects of both Irish-Canadian and French-Canadian identity in the province of Quebec. In particular, Jolivet looks at the interactions and mutual influences between these groups, interactions and influences that are based largely on a common religion, Roman Catholicism, and shared ideologies of nationalism with regard to both Ireland and Quebec.

Jolivet's starting point is the fact that people of Irish descent, particularly Irish Catholics, living in Quebec around the turn of the 20th century, maintain a distinctly Irish identity, an *irlandicité*, despite many of them being second or even third generation Canadians. Jolivet also seeks to examine how the French-Canadians responded to this *irlandicité*, how they responded to the political turmoil in Ireland, and how both these influenced their own sense of identity. Jolivet contends that this *irlandicité* was in part dependent on the involvement of Irish-Quebecers in the struggles for Irish autonomy from the British between 1898 and 1921. Much of the book is devoted to the close study of how both Irish-Quebecers and French-Canadians reacted to, and often took part in, the various struggles for Irish independence from British rule.

Jolivet's introduction contains a historical review of the formation, through immigration, of the Irish Community in Quebec. He presents a brief literature review on Irish identity in Quebec, Canada, and North America, hinging on an examination of how Irish-Quebecers' "état triplement minoritaire [Catholic in a largely Protestant Canada, Irish Catholic in a largely French-Canadian Catholic clerical culture, and anglophone in the largely francophone province of Quebec]" (25) might have caused them to integrate more slowly than their counterparts in English Canada.

Chapter one concerns itself primarily with the celebrations in Montreal and Quebec City marking the centenary of the Irish republican rebellion of 1798. It is in this chapter that Jolivet's extensive research into various archives, and his extensive use of popular newspapers and magazines of the time, begins to show. Chapters two and three are concerned with the early part of the 20th century, 1900-1916, and examine, respectively, the rise of various forms of Irish nationalism in Quebec and the concurrent and related revival of Gaelic culture, both in Ireland and in Quebec. Chapters four and five deal with issues of the First World War, its effect on Irish nationalism, as well as the problems surrounding conscription. Chapter four looks particularly at the failure of Home Rule and the consequences of the Easter Rising in Dublin. Chapter five examines the history of the all-Irish Rangers, a military unit raised in Quebec to fight in Europe,

and contains a very interesting analysis of the unit's recruiting posters. Chapter six, dealing with the years after the war and before Irish independence, traces the fragmentation of Irish nationalism into ever more clearly defined groups and the effect of this on French-Canadian opinion. Jolivet's conclusion offers ruminations on the direction of further studies and looks briefly at the situation after 1921.

This book amounts to an ambitious task overall, as Jolivet is forced to examine not only Irish Catholics and French-Canadians in Quebec, but also Irish Protestants, both inside and outside of the province, French-Canadians from other provinces, and the Irish, both Protestant and Catholic, in Ireland. While these other groups are outside of Jolivet's main thesis, they nevertheless are important actors in the pertinent events of the late 19th and early 20th century; Jolivet gives them their due.

Further complexity springs from the array of positions, political and ideological, held by the primary groups under study. Such positions include nationalism, republicanism, Home Rule, and the numerous political parties that supported these causes in Ireland. Also included are nationalism and separatism in Quebec, provincial and federal political parties, and those parties' positions not only on Quebec politics but on Irish issues as well. The complexity of the situation is at times labyrinthine, but Jolivet finds his way through and does a sound job of bringing the reader with him.

Part of Jolivet's effort to narrow the scope of the work is to limit his analysis largely to the two primary cities of the province, Montreal and Quebec City. He confines his sources mainly to newspapers, magazine articles, and archival letters, written by both Irish-Quebecers and French-Canadians, which he admits gives his analysis a point of view skewed towards the elite members of both the Irish-Quebecer and French-Canadian communities. Jolivet notes that in some respects, particularly when he looks at the parades and public demonstrations as evidence, the bias is redressed, as these indicate a lower class identity.

Indeed, in his conclusion, Jolivet addresses the need for more work on the topic, especially to round out the point of view, *vis-à-vis* his source material. He also highlights the need to expand the scope of the work to rural Quebec, where substantial pockets of Irish-Quebecers were to be found at the turn of the century.

While Jolivet does make an effort to ensure that the maze-like quality of Irish and French-Canadian politics and ideologies remains navigable by readers, his work seems nevertheless to be aimed at an audience conversant in both the history of Quebec and the history of Ireland.

The book overall does not provide much context for many of the events Jolivet highlights as important, such as the Irish Potato Famine or Canadian Confederation.

This problem is slightly ameliorated nearer the end of the work, as previous chapters begin to play the role of context (Jolivet's work here is laid out roughly chronologically).

Lastly, a few words are needed on the subject of the Roman Catholic Church. Central to the positioning of this book is the sense that the French-Canadians and the Irish-Quebecers, as coreligionists, share something along the lines of a culture, ideology, and way of being in the world. The terms Catholic and Protestant, for Jolivet, stand in for different "ethno-cultures" (16). Arguably, many would agree, although to some extent, Jolivet distances himself from the question of religion with the use of the term "ethno-cultures." In his introduction, Jolivet insists that this book takes the position that "il faut arriver à voir la religion comme *un* des facteurs (parmi d'autres) qui a pu forger les identités et parfois attiser les oppositions" (17; italics in original). Again, this is a defensible position, and one worth taking, especially if one's primary focus is not the Roman Catholic Church. Jolivet's book nevertheless misses out on some of the nuances of the relationship between Irish-Quebecers and French-Canadians with regard to their shared religion and the institution of the Roman Catholic Church in Quebec and in North America as a whole. Jolivet does occasionally treat bishops and other church officials as important players in the larger context of his work. However, he underestimates the role of the Church (and its officials) in the social and political life of Quebec in particular, and of Canada and North America in general. The Quebec Church often saw itself as the protector of Roman Catholicism in North America (based on its colonial heritage), and resented the growing powers of the Irish bishops and archbishops in English speaking parts of the continent. Such tensions are not fully explored in Jolivet's work and would be a welcome addition. Of course, like the studies of rural Irish communities, perhaps this is simply a case of further work to be done.

Jolivet's *Le vert et le bleu* is a very solid piece of scholarship about the relationships between Irish-Quebecers, French-Canadians, and the state of the Irish Nation in the early part of the 20th century. It is not a work aimed at a broad audience, but anyone with an interest in Quebec, Irish history or issues of identity will find the book useful. Jolivet's archival and periodical sources offer a useful insight into the period, if one that is mostly based on the views of the elite at the time. Scholars of religion might find the book lacking in some respects, but it is a valuable addition to academia nonetheless, and Jolivet is correct in pointing out that religion is not the be all and end all of identity.

Shaun L. Turriff
Concordia University